

**Present:**

- Reviewers: Yohannes Tesfaye, Solomon Mekonnen
- CC Ethiopia: Seble G. Baraki, legal lead

**Date:** October 09, 2016

**Place:** Bagel Corner Building 2<sup>nd</sup> floor, Addis Ababa

**Agenda:** Finalize the verification process of CC BY-NC-SA 4.0 after discussing and deliberating on comments raised by CC Ethiopia team.

The reviewers and legal lead of CC Ethiopia discussed and resolved the issues in the following manner. Grammatical issues raised in the team’s review were discussed and resolved as shown at the end of this document. Some of the issues were resolved and the decision made using preferential translation.

1. **“Attribution”** – it was agreed that keeping the original translation, **“አመንጪውን መጥቀስ”** was rational as it is more suited to describe the notion of attribution than the one adopted by the reviewers.
2. **“As is”** – the reviewers have agree that it would be incomplete to translate it literally and its not a commonly used word in Amharic so its better to keep **“መጠቀም”** in the Amharic version. Using ‘As is’ only and translating it literally could be unclear to the public.
3. Preferential translation has been used to change the phrase **“ስልጣን ያላቸው ሰዎች”** to **“ፍቃድ ለመስጠት መብት ያላቸው ሰዎች”** as the term **“ስልጣን”** is usually associated with political power in Ethiopia and would be clearer to uses as suggested by CC Ethiopia team. However, it should be noted that both versions are correct. However, it was agreed that the term **“ሰዎች”** should be maintained for clarification purposes. The CC Ethiopia team review suggested removing this term. The reviewers argued that taking out the word from the translation could render the Amharic version confusing and somehow meaningless. This is because a large part of the public is still unfamiliar with the whole concept of copyright.
4. The reviewers have accepted the rephrasing comment given under ‘Comment 7’ and they have revised the worksheet accordingly. This is done so with the intention to give the translation more sense and become easily understood by the public.
5. The phrase **“የሥራ ውጤት”** is kept as suggested by the reviewers. The comment raised by CC Ethiopia was rejected because it doesn’t go along with what is indicated in the CC translation guidelines. However, the reviewers have accepted the issue of consistency, raised by CC Ethiopia team, in using the phrase **“የሥራ ውጤት”** throughout the document.
6. The reviewers have accepted the comment raised by CC Ethiopia team regarding the term ‘transformed’ and is now changed to **“የሰራው አይነት የተቀየረበት”**. The newly used Amharic phrase will describe the term better than what was picked by the reviewers.

7. URI has an Amharic equivalent - የድህረ ገፅ አድራሻ. This was suggested by CC Ethiopia. The reviewers have accepted this because it's the correct way to describe the phrase and can be easily used.
8. Database – it is agreed by all to keep the transliteration of the English word “database” than translating it into Amharic. It should be noted that there is an Amharic phrase -የመረጃ ቆች- in use. However, we have preferred to use the Amharic transliteration of database taking in to consideration the current state of usage of the phrase in the Amharic language.
9. In comment 22, CC Ethiopia team suggested finding a better Amharic word for implied. The reviewers chose “አመልካች” which is an indicator rather than We have agreed to use an Amharic phrase “በውስጥ አዋቂ” for indicator.
10. Fair use/Fair dealing - The reviewer and CC Ethiopia have agreed that keeping the original translation might not try to describe the differences that exist between fair use and fair dealing. At the same time, the translation of fair dealing adopted by the reviewers is not suitable for describing the concept. Hence, we have come up with a better translation for Fair dealing, “ተገቢ አሰራር”. This will try to compromise the issues raised from both sides and will better express fair dealing in Amharic.
11. The reviewers accepted the suggestion under comment 29 and the English word “contact” was translated into “ማግኘት”.
12. A better phrase- ውርስ ስራ -to describes the element “Noderivatives” was suggested by Yohannes Tesfasye during our discussion and we have accepted it. Now it will be easier to incorporate this element, in Amharic, in the heading of the licenses that incorporate this element. The original version was too long as was the one adopted by the reviewers. We are all comfortable with using the phrase “ውርስ ስራ” to describe Noderivatives.
13. The suggestion given by CC Ethiopia on Comment 19 was accepted by the reviewers and is corrected in the final version accordingly.

The typos and grammatical errors outlined in CC Ethiopia team’s review (Comment 3, comment 6, comment 9 (using a bracket instead of a hyphen since its much better used in Amharic than the latter), comment 12, Comment 16, Comment 17, Comment 18, Comment 28) have been resolved and adjusted by the reviewers. This is with the exception of comment 8, comment 24 and comment 25/26. In regards, to comment 8, the reviewers have argued, and this accepted, to keep their version, a definite article that describes the English – “the public” – than the one suggested by CC Ethiopia team. The same is true for the suggestion given by the CC Ethiopia team under Comment 24,25&26. We have agreed to keep the reviewers versions in these instances.