



CC Arab Regional Meeting 2010

24 October 2010
Doha, Qatar

Meeting Objectives
Participants

Meeting Minutes

Appendix I: Translation Discussion Summary
Appendix II: Roadmaps

Meeting Objectives

- To identify opportunities for and plan Pan Arab collaboration among CC supporters in the region
- To develop roadmaps for individual jurisdictions as well as the broader Arab region that advance the adoption and understanding of CC across diverse communities
- To discuss challenges to the successful growth of CC in the region
- To exchange ideas for CC community building in jurisdictions (both existing and future)
- To gain a better understanding of the Arab World // CC community, and to share perspectives
- To familiarize teams, leads and community members from different jurisdictions with one another, for the purpose of improving regional communication and cooperation at the regional level
- To facilitate intra-jurisdictional communication between different supporters within each jurisdiction, to improve cooperation, outlook and outreach among them
- To develop concrete, actionable plans and next steps for jurisdictions and Pan Arab region

Participants

Creative Commons HQ

Joi Ito, CEO (Dubai/Japan)
Donatella della Ratta, Arab World Media and Dev. Manager (Italy)
Diane Peters, General Counsel (United States)
Eric Steuer, Creative Director (United States)
Michelle Thorne, Project Manager (Germany)
Paul Keller, CC Collecting Societies Liaison (Netherlands)
Jon Phillips, CC Fellow (United States)

Regional Participants

Official CC Leads

Hala Essalmawi, CC Egypt lead (Egypt)
Bassel Khartabil, CC Syria lead (Syria)
Pierre Khoury, CC Lebanon lead (Lebanon)
Mohamed Darwish, CC Lebanon lead (Lebanon)

CC Supporters in Region (Legal and Community Members)

Yahya Mekkawai (Egypt)
Eman Jaradat (Jordan)
Issa Mahasneh (Jordan)
Rami Olwan (Jordan)
Omar Taweeel (Jordan)
Fadi Baqi (Lebanon)
Naeema Zarif (Lebanon)
Habib Haddad (Lebanon)
Bilal Randeree (Qatar)
Mohamed Nanahbay (Qatar)
Moeed Ahmad (Qatar)
Mohamed Basheer (Qatar)
Mohamed el Said (Qatar)
Adnan Barambo (Qatar)
Brian Wesolowski (Qatar)
Stephanie Terroir (UAE)
Mahmoud Abu Wardeh (UAE)
Several representatives from ICT Qatar

Meeting Minutes

I. Welcome – Joichi Ito

Framing

- Importance of collaboration and constructive participation
- Promising growth and interest in Creative Commons since the last regional Arab World meeting in Doha in 2008
- CC Affiliate Network and CC Arab World maturing to next steps

Interoperability & Usability

- Important issue: interoperability and usability. Must get this right and avoid a broken or incompatible system. The success of CC in the Arab World and globally hinges on functioning legal tools.

Leadership & Strategic Planning

- Arab World has a unique opportunity through its linguistic unity among 22 countries. It is key to think beyond the specific needs and outcomes of one jurisdiction and focus on the region as a whole.
- Region demonstrates leadership with all active jurisdictions having roadmaps – Arab region is the first to produce roadmaps for each jurisdiction.

Translation

- Hope to reach a consensus coming out of this meeting on the harmonization of licenses names that everyone uses consistently, so that we avoid confusion for the end-users.

II. Introduction – Donatella della Ratta

Overview of agenda. Objectives and expected outcomes

- Clarity on organizational structure and how to engage with CC
- Feedback on jurisdiction roadmaps
- Beginnings of regional roadmap & inter-regional collaboration
- Consider establishing a Panarab Advisors Committee on legal issues
- Policy for how key CC license terms are expressed in Arabic
- Delegate website tasks

What would you like to accomplish today? Why would you like to contribute to CC and how? Sampling of responses from participants

- Would like to make progress on regional roadmap. Translation harmonization. CC is compatible with our Arab cultures.
- Would like to start on the right track and work with international communities and affiliates.
- Would like to kickoff several action projects. Achieve high visibility with Arabic content.
- Encourage people to start using and creating content.

III. Building a successful CC Jurisdiction & Regional Project - Diane Peters

CC Affiliate Network Program

- Official CC affiliates in over 70 jurisdictions around the world. Affiliates work together to build and maintain local communities that use CC legal tools.
- CC HQ wants to encourage affiliates and community to change the assumption that porting is the end game. The focus of the CC Affiliate Network is the communities that the licenses empower, not just a higher number of jurisdictions with jurisdiction-specific licenses.
- Relaunch of MOUs and Affiliates / CC responsibilities and roles. Drafts of MOU and policies available for comment from existing official team members until end of October http://wiki.creativecommons.org/MOU_and_Policies_Summary

Focus areas and objectives of the new MOU process and policies

- Accountability. Mandatory annual reporting. Some flexibility built in, but regular reporting is important for the board, the staff, and the CC Affiliate Network.
- Shared goal is to enhance projects prior to executing an MOU. Team building begins with reflection on what makes a successful team.
- MOUs are modular so that responsibilities can be best crafted for an Affiliate's needs and expertise. Non-exclusive, as in the past. Selection process based on strengths and resources. A few jurisdictions in the Arab World have already signed these new MOUs: Syria and Lebanon.
- Reporting and transparency about HQ back to CC Affiliate Network is also part of the new MOU.

IV. Special Role of Roadmaps - Michelle Thorne

Purpose

- Thanks to teams that have already completed first drafts of roadmaps, which were included in the welcome packets for all participants.
- Jurisdiction roadmaps improve collaboration and communication in a structured way. They illustrate the range of engagement points with CC: jurisdictional-level as well as regional, global, HQ staff, and board.
- Facilitate opportunities, communication, joint activities, mentoring, peer feedback. Not only within the region but around the world.

Logistics

- The document itself is dynamic and ever-evolving. It will be hosted on a jurisdictions wiki page: http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Jurisdiction_Database
- Wiki technology makes updating easy as well as flexible and searchable.
- Arab World is the first region to have each jurisdiction and regional roadmap. CC Asia-Pacific has also done great work: <http://cc-asia-pacific.wikidot.com/roadmap-for-the-cc-asia-the-pacific>

Objectives and Elements

- Accountability as described in MOU
- Annual reporting on at least a minimal level of activity. We're flexible if external circumstances arise or goals not met, but these goals & metrics should help the network gauge progress and focus its efforts.

- Priority goals. Define direction of work, strategic focus areas.
- Metrics. Achievable, quantifiable, tied to the priority goals.

Self Assessment

- Describes elements that make a successful teams including community, translation, legal, tech. wiki.creativecommons.org/images/1/1c/Self_Assessment_Tool.pdf
- Emphasis on multi-stakeholders. Diversity in expertise and partners.
- Affiliate teams are, as always, non-exclusive. Teams should actively recruit needed support, encourage volunteerism.
- Feedback welcome: http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Roadmap_Template

V. Working Session I: Building Jurisdiction and Regional Roadmaps

Jurisdiction Roadmaps – Affiliates and Community Members

Presentations were made by participants from each jurisdiction present for 10 minutes each. Roadmaps attached in Appendix.

EGYPT

Priority Goals

- Foster culture of copyright respect.
- Spread open culture (i.e. workshops).
- Help adoption target groups.

Activities

- Communication channels (website, FB pages, etc).
- CC Iftar feedback: might not be the most effective way to introduce CC.
- Workshops on licensing, other specific topics.
- Share/open media jam.

JORDAN

Priority Goals

- Creative sector adoption.
- Governmental sector adoption, including mention of CC in IS law.
- Awareness in legal profession.

Activities

- Royal Film Commission is a possible major adopter.
- Interested in team structure like the Netherlands.
- Regular meetings with tech community.
- Recruit more members in JOSA spirit.
- Arabic OER catalyst grant: [http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Grants/Arabic_Open_Educational_Resources_\(OER\)_Platform](http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Grants/Arabic_Open_Educational_Resources_(OER)_Platform)

Question: how to register localized CC logos?

- See: <http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Merchandising> and forthcoming

- Trademark Policy.
- Trademark: required to register internationally? Expensive to do. Registered in EU. Affiliates should let CC know if misuse happens. Teams can also let General Counsel know about local trademark registration process, and judgments will be made on a case by case basis.

LEBANON

Priority Goals

- Foster publication of raw materials via “unflattened media”, open layers to facilitate remix.
- Improving CC Search with metadata for Arabic work. Post documentation about marking. Bassel to help with RDFa, marking, Search Engine Optimization.
- Remixes and Jam sessions.

Activities

- Newspaper adoption.
- Locked room collaboration.
- Produce Case Studies: http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Case_Studies
- Launch event: <http://creativecommons.org/weblog/entry/24467>
- Set up a website.
- Localize flyers with legal perspective.
- Translate licenses.

UNITED ARAB EMIRATES

Priority Goals

- Awareness among content producers, especially publishing sector.
- Educational content under CC. Working with OER.
- Possible collaboration with Issa on CC Catalyst Grant project.
- Rami will provide CC Clinic courses from Australia.
- Teach open source at university. CC should be taught in courses.
- Licensing porting.
- Challenge to find legal expertise (blessing in disguise because allows to focus on content creators).

Activities

- Participated in the CC Iftar.
- 2 team members but many active supporters.
- Committing to one salon per quarter.
- Possibly approaching film festival.
- Transform how tech is used regionally.
- Looking for a better way to celebrate CC successes.
- Should contact founder of Geekfest to hold one in Dubai.

SYRIA

Priority Goals

- Training workshops and "exposure" events with creative communities.
- Research on license usage.
- Launched arabic.creativecommons.org site.

Activities

- Regular "Sharism" meetings. 2,311 participants reached overall, many return for other meetings.
- Attended CC Asia-Pacific meeting.
- Registered with an official logo.
- Post-war working on bringing the jurisdiction together with a positive message.

QATAR

Priority Goals

- Digitization.
- Education.
- Government adoption, hopefully also media.

Activities

- Grow community. Feels like there is no community currently, but it doesn't take many. Plus, great turnout at Digitally Open.
- Diversify. Project can't just be from government, needs others to propel forward.
- Activities can work in parallel.
- Geek fest to be organized in Qatar as community outreach effort.

NEXT STEPS

- Chart and develop ideas formulated independently and collectively. Build regional roadmap.
- Get feedback & images from iftars for Joi to show Aramex.
- Identify possible sponsors for future PanArab events.
- Track the location of a CC album from Meen, the Lebanese band, with instructions for sharing (social game).

VI. Translation and Language - Diane Peters

Issues and Opportunities

- User-friendly.
- Forthcoming translation plan will be provided by CC.
- Unified pan-Arab translation of the international/unported licenses is one possible objective. Teams can also help with French & other languages spoken in the region.
- Deeds are not a legal instrument. The names don't have to be an end-all, but rather a practical solution.
- **"Creative Commons" is a legal name and brand.** There's often no equivalent. Need regional solution that protects CC's brand.
- **Solution also needed for all names of license elements.** The translation decision from today's meeting, with the regional representatives (both legal and

community) present and consenting, will be final and binding on all Arabic licenses and ports for the foreseeable future.

Spanish Harmonization: A Case Study

- 9+ Spanish-speaking jurisdictions harmonized their different terms through an affiliate-led effort. All teams, except Spain that opted out, changed term to "atribucion" for better usability. Some of the terms that were agreed upon ended up being chosen not because they were the most prevalent among the teams but because they were most usable.
- Guidance by CC: Choose the most legally accurate term if possible and usable; do not choose a term that contradicts the legal meaning of the relevant license term/condition.

ARABIC DISCUSSION: TRANSLATION OF KEY TERMS

Discussion among Arab participants in meeting. At CC's request, the discussion was moderated by Bassel Khartabil and Mahmoud Abu Wardeh and lasted several hours. Please see Appendix I for a summary in Arabic kindly provided by Bassel Khartabil and Mahmoud Abu Wardeh.

Everyone present was strongly encouraged to present their ideas and those from others in the region and to listen to the suggestions of others. Most of this discussion transpired in Arabic; Joi and Diane provided guidance when difficult questions of interpretation and usability were posed.

In the end, everyone present agreed that having heard all ideas and debated thoroughly, the following license terms would be standard and used for (i) all licenses in Arabic (ported or unported), (ii) the deeds, (iii) on all websites and CC-related materials, and (iv) elsewhere, whenever it was a description of the license terms. Additionally, the present participants agreed on the following approach for translating Creative Commons:

The name “Creative Commons” would be translated as provided below but always immediately followed by a parenthetical with the name spelled in English). The name could also simply be presented in English without any translation.

FINAL TRANSLATION OF KEY CREATIVE COMMON TERMS IN ARABIC

- Attribution: نسب المصنف
- ShareAlike: الترخيص بالمثل
- NonCommercial: غير تجاري
- NoDerivatives: منع الإشتقاق
- Creative Commons: المشاع الإبداعي mentioned with the original English name (Creative Commons)

See: <http://twitpic.com/30i0c4>

VII. Parallel Session: Towards a Regional Roadmap - Community Members

Regional Roadmap Planning and Evaluation

- What are indicators of a healthy, successful project and region?
Key partnerships. Key adopters and promoters. Funding. Diversity.
Inclusiveness. Mentoring.
Strategies for including the Maghreb?
- Evaluation of recent activities, possible paths forward
Websites (regional: arabic.creativecommons.org, jurisdictional). Salons.
Iftars. Qatar Conference
- Metrics: how do we measure success?
Adoption impact. Case Studies. Innovative Uses

Website – a shared responsibility and opportunity

- Website Team
 - Bassel (help desk, integrate "Posterous" update function)
 - Stephanie (design)
 - Issa (content, coding, translation)
 - Fadi (comics, animation)
 - Naeema (map, infographics)
 - Bashir (common craft)
 - Yahya (video translation)
 - Mahmoud (content)
- Aggregation from all jurisdiction feeds on arabic.creativecommons.org
- Google changed page rank by language & country. Provide a URL for both.
- If no MOU in a jurisdiction,, you can use the Arabic portal. With an MOU, you can register country domain like .sy.
- See CC's Internet Services Policy: http://wiki.creativecommons.org/Internet_Services

Social media

- Facebook: <https://www.facebook.com/pages/Creative-Commons-arab-world/168477436501347?ref=ts>
- Twitter account (@cciftar). Run by Eman.
- Contact Management System? CC's CivicCRM to be integrated. People should use for contact info and to search expertise.
- Also Google Groups? Other ideas?

VII. Parallel Session: CC Licenses and Legal - Lawyers

The role and philosophy of license porting – Diane Peters

- CC has established a policy against porting of its licenses in jurisdictions prior to the establishment of a robust, local community outreach program.
- CC approves such proposals only after a thorough review of the rationale and need for that localization.

- Please consider participating in our unofficial license translation program instead, coming soon.

Porting Case Study: CC Egypt - Hala Essalmawai.

- Hala shared public discussion experience and described the key license terms that required some adaptation based on local Egyptian law. Consideration given to moral rights, exceptions & limitations, related rights holder, collecting rights, and similar.
- Lawyers from the other jurisdictions inquired about commonalities and differences between laws.

Other Discussion

- Priority goals include awareness and the community, and educating ministries and governments.
- Exchange of ideas for reaching out and coordinating with others in the region who are also interested.
- Possibility of creating a publication about CC in each country and producing a regional guide to CC. Suggestion that perhaps could start with chapter from Egyptian A2K publication that discusses CC (but without confusing CC with the A2K effort).
- Willing to consider an informal legal email list where questions about CC licenses and legal issues can be debated. Diane will start conversation with lawyers in region – perhaps best to use existing email list and have conversation take place with community members rather than isolated to just lawyers.
- Global meeting in 2011: Diane provided an overview of the legal conversations that will be taking place, and welcomed suggestions from others about content of the meeting and workgroups. More information will be forthcoming from CC HQ soon.

VIII. Outcomes and Next Steps

- Regional outcomes and next steps
- Formation of inter-jurisdictional workgroups
- Sharing meeting outcomes locally
- Implementing new translation terms.

Photos!

<http://www.flickr.com/photos/joi/sets/72157625223000452/with/5110100065/>

<http://www.flickr.com/photos/ictqatar/sets/72157625126880547/>

<http://www.flickr.com/photos/mohamedn/sets/72157625236069762/with/5112964517/>

Appendix I: Translation Discussion Summary

Prepared by Bassel Safadi and Mahmoud Abu-Wardeh sent on Novemeber 18, 2010 to cc-arab-world@googlegroups.com.

كما تعلمون فان المجلس الاعلى للاتصالات في قطر استضاف في الرابع والعشرين من الشهر الماضي مشكورا في المنطقة العربية، وقد حضر الاجتماع عدد (Creative Commons) إجتماعاً إقليمياً لمؤسسة المشاع الإبداعي من المهتمين بمجال الرخص الحرة وممثلي المشاع الإبداعي في العالم العربي بالإضافة إلى العديد من موظفي المقر الرئيسي وقد تم نقاش العديد من النقاط بما فيها إنتشار استخدام الرخص والخطوات القادمة من أجل إشهار الفكرة، ولكن وبناء على رغبة المشاركيين تم التركيز على موضوع الترجمة والتي كانت أحد عوائق انتشار الرخص في العالم العربي، حيث وكما تعلمون تم الاتفاق في الاجتماع الأول في 2008 والذي استضافته قناعة الجزيرة في قطر، على تسمية منظمة كريبيتف كومونز: المشاع الإبداعي باللغة العربية، لكن وبسبب الازدياد الكبير لعدد مستخدمي الرخص وانضمام عدد من الدول العربية فيما بعد، نشأت بعض الخلافات على اسم المنظمة بالإضافة إلى بعض الاختلافات على ترجمة أسماء رخص المشاع الإبداعي، وبما أن العالم العربي يتحدث لغة واحدة فمن غير المنطقي وجود أكثر من ترجمة لنفس الاسم. لذلك تم مناقشة موضوع الترجمة بشكل تفصيلي وتم الاتفاق على توحيد المصطلحات أثناء الاجتماع والذي حضره كل من:

من المنظمة الأم:

جوي إيتو، المدير التنفيذي

ديان بيترز، المسؤولة القانونية

ميشيل تورن، مسؤولة العلاقات العالمية

دوناتيلا ديلا راتا، مسؤولة العالم العربي

إيرك ستيفوار، إداري

باول كيلر، مسؤول هولندا

جون فيليبس

ممثلي المشاع الإبداعي الرسميين في العالم العربي:

هالة السلماوي، مصر

باسل الصدفي: سورية

بيبر الخوري: لبنان

محمد درويش: لبنان

متطوعي وداعمي المشاع الإبداعي في العالم العربي:

يحيى مكاوي، مصر

رامي علوان، الأردن

إيمان جردات، الأردن

عيسى المحاسنة، الأردن

عمر طويل، الأردن

فادي بكى، لبنان

نعيمة ظريف، لبنان

حبيب حداد، لبنان

ستيفاني تيروار: الإمارات

محمود أبو وردة: الإمارات

بلال رنيري، قطر

محمد نانبائي، قطر

مؤيد أحمد، قطر

محمد بشير، قطر

محمد السيد، قطر

برلين فيسولوسكي: قطر
وعدد من موظفي المجلس الأعلى للإتصالات في قطر

وتم النقاش على النقاط التالية:
1- ترجمة الإسم Creative Commons
2- ترجمة أسماء الرخص

دار نقاش طويل حول موضوع ترجمة الإسم، وقد تم تقديم العديد من الاقتراحات الجيدة، وكانت المشكلة الرئيسية لدى العديدين هي في كلمة (المشاع الإبداعي) والمستخدمة منذ ثلاث سنوات وحتى الآن، حيث يعتقد البعض أن كلمة المشاع تعني (عدم إمتلاك العمل وتوفره للعامة) في حين أن المشاع الإبداعي كمنظمة وفكرة توكل دائمًا على ضرورة حفظ حقوق المؤلف الأصلي للعمل، وقد دافع كل من المحامي رامي وعلوان والمحامية هالة السلماوي عن فكرة الترجمة، حيث أنه في قوانين الأردن ومصر تعني كلمة المشاع الشيوع (أي الملك الجماعي)، في حين عارض المحامي ببير الخوري الإسم في البداية وقدم العديد من الاقتراحات، ثم وبعد مناقشة تفصيلية اقتنع الجميع بأن كلمة المشاع الإبداعي وبين أنه من المناسب أن يكون Creative Commons صحيحة قانونياً، كما قام جوي إيتو بشرح فكرة اسم المنظمة اسم فريد حتى تصبح عالمة مميزة، فليس الهدف من الاسم شرح الفكرة وإنما يتم شرح الفكرة من خلال قراءة الرخص أو المقالات العربية التي تشرح الفكرة ومن الجدير بالذكر انه حتى بالإنكليزية اسم كريينف كومونز غامض للوهلة الأولى ولذلك اتفق جميع الحضور على المحافظة على التسمية الحالية بالعربية وهي المشاع الإبداعي بشرط ذكر الإسم الأصلي بالإنكليزية إلى جانب الإسم العربي وذلك منعاً للالتباس فتصبح الإسم الكامل على الشكل: المشاع ويصح استخدام الإسم باللغة الإنكليزية بأحرف إنكليزية فقط بدون الإسم العربي (Creative Commons) الإبداعي.
وهو أمر اختياري.

رجاء تحميل الملف Commons للاستماع إلى تعليق لورانس ليسغ حول معنى كلمة:
اما بالنسبة لترجمة أسماء الرخص وهي

اعتمدت الترجمة: (نسب المصنف) بدلاً من الاسم السابق المستخدم في الرخصتين المصرية والأردنية (نسبة المصنف) بعد نقاش طويل شارك فيه الجميع، وقد تم تقديم العديد من الاقتراحات منها: العزو والإسناد. ولم يتم استخدام كلمة العزو بسبب كونها غير واضحة للوهلة الأولى في حين أن نسبة المصنف أكثر تعبيراً عن المعنى، وقد أوضح جوي إيتو أن المقصود بـنسب المصنف هو نسبة المصنف لمؤلفه وهو أمر مهم للغاية لفهم معنى الكلمة. فمثلاً إذا استخدم مدون صورة مأخوذة من كتاب منشور تحت إحدى رخص المشاع الإبداعي، فيجب أن يذكر اسم مؤلف الكتاب أسفل الصورة بالإضافة إلى اسم الكتاب.

اعتمدت الترجمة: (الترخيص بالمثل) بدلاً من الاسم السابق المستخدم في الرخصتين المصرية والأردنية ShareAlike (المشاركة على قدم المساواة)، حيث أن الرخصة إذا استخدمت على عمل ما فهي تعني أنه يمكن للأخرين إنشاء أعمال مشتقة من العمل الأصلي ولكن يتشرط أن تنشر هذه الأعمال المشتقة تحت نفس الرخصة المنوش بها. العمل الأصلي.

تترجم إلى (غير تجاري) بدلاً من (غير تجارية) حيث أن الترخيص في اللغة العربية مذكور، NonCommercial وهي نفس الترجمة المعتمدة تقريباً والمتافق عليها سابقاً من قبل جميع المساهمين في مشروع الترجمة، وتعني منع استخدام العمل المنوش تحت هذه الرخصة لأغراض تجارية.

اعتمدت الترجمة (منع الإشتقاق) بدلاً من الترجمة السابقة (من غير إشتقاق) وذلك لتوضيح أن NoDerivatives استخدام هذه الرخصة على عمل ما يمنع المستخدم من تعديل هذا العمل ويمتنعه من إنشاء أعمال مشتقة، في حين أنه يبقى له المجال مفتوحاً لإعادة نشر العمل كما هو بدون تعديل.

وفي النهاية نتمنى من الجميع ومنعاً للالتباس استخدام الأسماء الجديدة للرخص بهدف توحيد المصطلحات حيث أننا جميعاً نتكلم لغة عربية واحدة ونهدف جميعاً لنشر حرية الثقافة على شبكة الانترنت.

(: وشكرا

Appendix II: Roadmaps

See email attachments.